

FINANCE AUDIT COMMITTEE AGENDA

June 8, 2017 9:30 a.m.

Committee Room, Cariboo Regional District Suite D - 180 North Third Avenue Williams Lake, BC

Pages

1. CALL TO ORDER

(The meeting is scheduled to commence at 9:30 a.m.)

1.1 Adoption of Agenda

That the agenda items be adopted as presented.

2. ADOPTION OF MINUTES

2.1 Finance/Audit Committee Minutes - April 12, 2017

1 - 3

That the minutes of the Finance/Audit Committee meeting, held April 12, 2017, be received and adopted.

3. REPORTS AND CORRESPONDENCE

3.1 Remuneration Survey and SOFI Comparisons

4 - 22

That the Board Remuneration Review Summary of Market Information for Participants from the Columbia Shuswap Regional District and the directors remuneration survey summaries, be received. *Further action at the discretion of the Committee*.

4. ADJOURNMENT

That the meeting of the Finance/Audit Committee be adjourned at TIME, June 8, 2017.



FINANCE/AUDIT COMMITTEE MINUTES

April 12, 2017 4:30 p.m.

Cariboo Regional District Board Room Suite D - 180 Third Avenue North Williams Lake, B.C.

PRESENT: Chair M. Wagner, Director J. Sorley, Director B. Simpson, Director J.

Bruce, Director J. Massier, Director A. Richmond

STAFF: J. Bell, Chief Administrative Officer, S. Reid, Chief Financial Officer

1. <u>CALL TO ORDER</u>

1.1 Adoption of Agenda

FAC.2017-4-1

Moved by Director Massier Seconded by Director Sorley

That the agenda items be adopted as presented.

Carried Unanimously

2. ADOPTION OF MINUTES

2.1 Finance / Audit Committee Minutes - February 8, 2017

FAC.2017-4-2

Moved by Director Bruce Seconded by Director Massier

That the minutes of the Finance / Audit Committee meeting, held February 8, 2017, be received and adopted.

Carried Unanimously

3. REPORTS AND CORRESPONDENCE

3.2 Terms of Reference – Library Program and Services Review

FAC.2017-4-3

Moved by Director Massier Seconded by Director Bruce

That the agenda item summary from Wanda Davis, Manager of Library Services, dated April 5, 2017, and attached Terms of Reference for a Library Program Review, be received. Further, that staff send out a Request for Proposal for a Library Program Review.

Carried Unanimously

3.1 Amendments to Directors' Remuneration and Expenses Bylaw

FAC.2017-4-4

Moved by Director Sorley Seconded by Director Bruce

That the agenda item summary from Scott Reid, Chief Financial Officer, dated April 4, 2017, regarding amendments to the Directors' Remuneration and Expenses Bylaw, be received.

Further, that Cariboo Regional District Directors' Remuneration and Expenses Bylaw No. 5055, 2016 be amended to include an Interpretation and Application section identifying the CRD Finance Chair as the person responsible for reviewing and approving Directors' Remuneration and Expense Reports; and the CRD Board Chair as the person responsible for reviewing and approving the Finance Chair's Remuneration and Expense Reports. Further that the section also state that disputes regarding Directors' Remuneration and Expense Reports be forwarded to the Executive Committee for resolution and, then to the Board if not resolved by the Executive Committee.

Still further, that staff make the necessary changes to Cariboo Regional District Directors' Remuneration and Expenses Bylaw No. 5055, 2016 and bring the amended bylaw forward to the Board for consideration.

Carried Unanimously

4. <u>DISCUSSION ITEMS</u>

4.1 Potential Bylaw regarding Eligible Claims for Attendance at an Executive Committee Meeting

FAC.2017-4-5

Moved by Director Sorley Seconded by Director Massier

That Cariboo Regional District Directors' Remuneration and Expenses Bylaw No. 5055, 2016 be amended to include travel time and mileage as eligible claims for Directors' attendance at Executive Committee meetings.

Carried Unanimously

FAC.2017-4-6

Moved by Director Sorley Seconded by Director Bruce

That staff bring the SOFI Report forward to a future meeting of the Finance Audit Committee, for the purpose of starting a review of current Board remuneration practices.

Carried Unanimously

4.3 Facilitation of Separate Meeting and Remuneration Submissions

FAC.2017-4-7

Moved by Director Sorley Seconded by Director Massier

That a pilot project for providing Directors with Cariboo Regional District credit cards, to be used for eligible expenses, be started with members of the Finance Audit Committee.

Carried Unanimously

5. ADJOURNMENT

FAC.2017-4-8

Moved by Director Sorley Seconded by Director Bruce

That the meeting of the Finance/Audit Committee be adjourned at 6:10 p.m., April 12, 2017

2017.	
	Carried Unanimously
Chair	-
Corporate Officer	_

Sainas Consult Inc.

Columbia Shuswap Regional District

Board Remuneration Review Summary of Market Information for Participants

September 2016

Contact:

Katherine M Sainas, MBA, CMC
Direct 604.221.9155
Mobile 604.831.4205
Toll-free fax 1.866.799.7884
kathys@sainasconsult.com

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction	1
COMPARISON ORGANIZATIONS	2
Information Collected	3
Market Findings	4
DEMUNEDATION CTRUCTURE	4
REMUNERATION STRUCTURE	4
ACTUAL REMUNERATION PAID - 2015 SOFI INFORMATION	8

INTRODUCTION

The Columbia Shuswap Regional District (CSRD) serves approximately 51,000 residents from six electoral areas and four municipal governments throughout the Columbia Shuswap Region.

CSRD employees provide services through the following Departments:

- Corporate Administration
- Development Services
- Film Commission
- Finance
- Information Technology & GIS
- Operations Management
- Shuswap Economic Development
- Shuswap Tourism

The Board of Directors is comprised of 11 elected officials. The CSRD Director Remuneration Bylaw No. 5510 was approved in 2008 and a minor amendment was approved in November 2015. The CSRD Board of Directors commissioned an independent comprehensive review of Director remuneration.

This report contains a summary of the market findings for the regional districts that kindly provided information to assist with this review.

COMPARISON ORGANIZATIONS

Market data was obtained from the following regional districts:

Regional District	2011 Census Population	2014 Consolidated Expenses	Area at Dec 2013 (km²)	Density (/km2)	No. of Mun Dir	No. of EA Dir	Total No. of Dir
Thompson-Nicola	128,473	\$41,016,041	45,283	2.84	16	10	26
North Okanagan	81,237	\$63,964,910	7,902	10.28	9	5	14
Cariboo	62,392	\$28,295,850	83,145	0.75	4	12	16
Central Kootenay	58,441	\$41,220,890	23,161	2.52	9	11	20
East Kootenay	56,685	\$24,192,109	27,572	2.06	9	6	15
Bulkley-Nechako	39,208	\$11,906,760	77,821	0.50	8	7	15
Okanagan- Similkameen	80,742	\$30,564,197	11,018	7.33	10	8	18
Kitimat-Stikine	37,361	\$10,982,314	107,471	0.35	6	6	12
Fraser Fort George	91,879	\$36,546,870	51,999	1.77	7	7	14

*Source: Ministry of Community, Sport and Cultural Development; CivicInfo BC surveys and statistics (includes data from BC Municipalities and the Local Government Management Association of BC)

INFORMATION COLLECTED

We contacted the comparison regional districts for the following information:

- 1. Annual base stipends for:
 - Electoral Area Director
 - Municipal Director
 - Regional District Chair
 - Vice Chair
- 2. Whether there is variation in the Electoral Area Director base stipends based on some variable (e.g. population, distance).
- 3. What the base stipend is intended to remunerate (i.e. are Board and/or other meetings included?)
- 4. Meeting rates for:
 - Regular board meetings, if the base annual stipend does not include attendance at board meetings
 - Special meetings, committee, and commission meetings, and whether the rates are differentiated by length of meeting
 - Committee chairs
- 5. Payment for time spent travelling to meetings at the regional district office
- 6. Whether meeting payments to Alternate Directors are deducted from the Director's base stipend
- 7. Most recent SOFI information published by the comparison regional districts to obtain and analyze:
 - Remuneration for Chair and Directors
 - Total Board Remuneration

Director expenses and group benefits were not included in this review.

This report contains the market findings in two sections:

- "REMUNERATION STRUCTURE" covers annual stipends, Chair and Vice Chair add-ons/flat amounts, meeting allowances, and payment for travel time as outlined in the Regional Districts' Director Remuneration Bylaws
- "ACTUAL REMUNERATION PAID" summarizes the actual Director remuneration paid in 2015 as per the Regional Districts' 2015 Statements of Financial Information

Market Findings

The statistics presented in the tables in this report include the 25th percentile, median, average, and the 75th percentile of the market, which are defined as:

25th Percentile: This is also referred to as the first quartile. It represents the point below which 25% of the values fall (separates the lowest 25% of data from the highest 75%)

Median: This is also referred to as the 50th percentile. When the values in the population are ranked by size, the median represents the point at which equal numbers of values are above and below. It is the "middle" salary in the population (separates the data set in half).

Average: This is the simple average provided for matching positions. Also known as the mean, it is derived from summing all of the values and dividing by number of organizations.

75th Percentile: This is also referred to as the third quartile. It represents the point below which 75% of the values fall (separates the highest 25% of data from the lowest 75%).

REMUNERATION STRUCTURE

This section summarizes the information contained in the comparison Regional Districts' current director remuneration bylaws. The CSRD information is not included as there will be changes to the Director remuneration bylaw.

Annual Base Stipends

Annual stipends are provided by the comparison regional districts to their Electoral Area and Municipal Directors as follows:

Directors' annual base stipends (9 regional districts):

	25th %ile	Average	Median	75th %ile
Electoral Area Director	\$13,956	\$18,853	\$19,516	\$20,474
Municipal Director	\$6,936	\$9,620	\$10,061	\$11,687

For three of the regional districts, the annual base stipend includes attendance at regular board meetings.

Seven of the nine regional districts provide the same base stipend amount to all Electoral Area Directors, while two differentiate base stipends based on distance/travel time or population.

Chair and Vice Chair Remuneration

Remuneration for the Chair position is provided by the comparison regional districts as follows:

Statistics for Chair add-on (9 regional districts):

	25th %ile	Average	Median	75th %ile
Chair add-on to Director stipend	\$15,000	\$17,613	\$15,312	\$18,498

Statistics for Vice Chair add-on (8 regional districts):

	25th %ile	Average	Median	75th %ile
Vice Chair add-on to Director stipend	\$2,644	\$4,395	\$4,340	\$6,051

Meeting Allowances

The statistics for meeting allowances provided by the comparison regional districts are shown below:

Meeting Allowances: Directors

Type of Meeting	25th %ile	Average	Median	75th %ile
Board Meetings (where not included in base stipend)	\$185	\$225	\$196	\$217
Other Meetings - full day	\$128	\$163	\$150	\$175
Other Meetings - half day	\$75	\$101	\$98	\$115

Meeting Allowances: Alternate Directors

Type of Meeting	25th %ile	Average	Median	75th %ile
Board Meetings	\$185	\$243	\$206	\$302
Other Meetings	\$99	\$138	\$135	\$166

Committee Chair

For the five regional districts that provide payment for Committee Chairs, the arrangements are shown below:

- \$13 per meeting as permanent chair of Standing Committee
- \$2,524 per year
- \$2,724 per year for Chairing standing, select, and other Board established committees
- \$4,104 per year for Chairing Standing or Select Committee
- \$100 per meeting for Chairing Standing or Select Committee

Travel Time

Where included in the remuneration bylaw of the other Regional Districts, the arrangements for compensating Directors for travel time are shown below.

Included in Base Stipend:

- Municipal and Electoral Area Directors receive varying base stipend amounts based on distance/travel time
- A travel allowance is included in the base stipend for Electoral Area Directors; however, the allowance is the same for all Electoral Area Directors and is not differentiated by distance

Other Policies:

- Travel time is paid separately: \$20 per 100 km driven; \$20 per hour flown
- Travel time is paid separately: \$20 per hour of travel if more than 30 minutes
- No payment for travel time; however, travel time is included in the determination of half vs. full-day meetings
- Directors are provided a special allowance: \$3600, \$2400, \$1200 for Electoral Area Directors, depending on distance; \$900 for Municipal Directors

These are in addition to the automobile expense reimbursement rates per kilometer stipulated in the regional district's expense policy.

ACTUAL REMUNERATION PAID - 2015 SOFI INFORMATION

The following table contains the statistics for the actual remuneration paid to the Board positions based on the most recent Statements of Financial Information available. The CSRD information is included in this section.

This information does not include expenses.

Position	25th %ile	Average	Median	75th %ile
Chair ¹	\$34,556	\$40,899	\$41,430	\$45,630
Vice Chair ²	\$19,785	\$20,995	\$20,982	\$23,248
Lowest EA Director/RD	\$18,937	\$23,082	\$22,362	\$25,800
Average EA Director/RD	\$19,566	\$24,951	\$25,614	\$28,030
Highest EA Director/RD	\$20,526	\$26,939	\$28,101	\$30,551
Lowest Muni Director/RD	\$11,757	\$12,524	\$12,159	\$13,944
Average Muni Director/RD	\$12,737	\$13,986	\$13,906	\$14,490
Highest Muni Director/RD	\$14,772	\$15,608	\$15,827	\$16,494

Statistics showing the total board remuneration (excluding expenses), as a percentage of the Regional District's budget, are shown below.

	25th %ile	Average	Median	75th %ile
Total Board Remuneration	\$258,402	\$346,542	\$312,325	\$406,264
Board Remuneration as % of Regional District Budget	0.93%	1.30%	1.31%	1.49%

Sainas Consult Inc

8

¹ Three of the comparison Regional District Chairs are Municipal Directors

² Four of the comparison Regional District Vice Chairs are Municipal Directors

									Regional District			
	CSRD	Squamish Lilloet	Fraser-Fort George	Nanaimo	East Kootenay	Cowichan Valley	Alberni-Clayoquot	Powell River	Central Coast	Fraser Valley	Comox Valley	Thompson Nicola
Summary of email answers	555										,	
3. Number of directors in RD	11	9	14	17	15	15	14	7	5	23	10	26
- Rural	6	4	7	7	6	9	6	5	5	8	3	10
- Municipal	5	5	7	10	9	6	4	2	-	15	7	16
- First Nations							4			-	-	-
4. 2017 budget excluding municipal debt	\$ 38,955,582	\$ 21,839,393	\$ 45,834,610	\$ 87,900,000	\$ 38,300,000	\$ 77,394,000	\$ 17,750,000	\$ 13,830,000	\$ 2,922,000	\$ 24,300,000	\$ 109,980,000	\$ 45,507,000
5.a) Number of board meetings per month	1	2.0	1.0	2.0	1.0	2.0	2.0	2.0	1.0	1.0	1.0	1.5
5.b) Average duration of board meetings	5-6 hrs	5-6 hrs	1-3 hrs		3 hours	3.5 hrs	3.5 hrs	2 hrs	6.5 hrs	2-3 hrs	1 hour	not identified
5.c) Municipal directors stay for whole meeting	no	Yes	Yes	Not generally		Yes	not generally	no	n/a	yes	yes	yes
									n/a - no stipends;			
6. Director stipend includes board meeting attendance?	no	Yes	Yes	4 only	No - \$185/mtg	Yes	yes	yes	attendance only	yes	no	yes
7.a) Stipend include travel time to Board Meetings?	no	Yes	No	Not generally	No	No	yes	no	no	yes	no	yes
											\$20/hr where travel	
		Add'l amount paid for	Expense reimburse	Expense reimburse	\$20/hr in excess of 30						exceeds 60km one	
7.b) If no, how is travel time paid?	\$.15/km	mileage	only	only	minutes each way	mileage only		mileage	mileage	n/a	way	n/a
8.a) Add-on for Chair?	\$ 24,102	\$ 10,724	\$ 14,500	\$ 19,500	\$ 18,000	\$ 25,000	\$ 6,328	\$ 8,232	\$ 4,800	\$ 26,940	\$ 29,604	\$ 18,830
												\$2,290 annually plus
												\$150 per meeting
	\$159 to chair a			\$160 to chair a					extra \$50 to chair a			chaired and/or
8.b) Add-on for Vice-Chair?	meeting	\$ 1,778	\$ 2,500	meeting	\$ 3,000	-	-	no	meeting	\$ 6,601	no	convention days
9. Directors paid to attend other meetings?	yes	yes	yes	Yes	yes	only VITAC	yes	yes	yes	no	yes	yes
		_						_				
	\$62-\$196 based on	\$92-159 based on		\$70 - \$110 based on								
- If yes, amount?	type	duration	\$ 100	duration	\$ 90	\$ 291.07		\$75-\$180	\$75-\$200	n/a	\$ 125	\$ 150
10. Directors paid to attend public hearings?	No	No	yes	Yes	yes	no	no	no	yes	no	yes	depends
- If yes, amount?	n/a	n/a	\$ 75	as above	\$ 75	n/a	n/a	n/a	\$ 75	n/a	\$ 125	\$ 150
11. Extra paid to committee chairs?	No	EAD only	No	Yes	no	no	no	no	no	yes	yes	no
				\$110 per meeting								
- If yes, amount?	n/a	\$ 2,805	n/a	chaired	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	\$1,743 annually	\$75 per meeting	n/a
		UBCM, EA and Chair										
		are paid. FCM, EAD										
		and Chair are paid										
		(only Chair goes),		All can attend UBCM,				all can; only one				fcm is limited to
		SILGA, EAD and Board		AVICC, 4 FCM (take				director attended				attend once every
12. All directors allowed to attend conferences?	yes	Rep (if muni) are paid	All can	turns)	yes - EA only	All can	all can	FCM	attendance is limited	yes	ea directors only	four years
		No, just expense		No, \$75 per diem for								yes; amount is based
13. Pay for travel time for attendance at above conferences?	yes - daily meeting fee	reimburse	No	nights away	No	No	no	yes - \$100	1/2 day for travel	no	no	on distance
		- -						-				
		Switched to including										
		meeting fees and								simple - 1 mthly		well laid out and
		travel in stipend,				annual increase				amount covers		covers most
14.a) What do you like about current remuneration bylaw?	not much	much easier.	Straight forward			linked to CUPE	easy to administer			everything		everything
				Painful re: tracking of								
	too much grov area:			committee meetings								
	too much grey area; difficulty in capturing			and ensuring equal								
	meeting			pay and mileage.							confusing and	
	attendance/authoriza			Similar issues to ours							directors don't think	
	tion; inequities			with lack of specifics							travel time is an	
	between municipal			in bylaw. Would				extra meeting nav is				
	and electoral area			prefer lump sum to				extra meeting pay is troublesome to			accurate representation of	difficult for Board
14.b) What is troublesome with your current bylaw?	directors		No issues	cover everything.				administer			actual travel	members to read
2 1.5, What is troublesome with your current bylaw:	an cetors		110 1330/03	cover everytimig.				danningter			actual travel	
<u> </u>												

	CSRD	Caribou	Peace River	Central Okanagan	Bulkley Nechako	North Okanagan	Sunshine Coast
Summary of email answers							
3. Number of directors in RD	11	16	12	12	15	14	8
- Rural	6		. 4	2	7	5	5
- Municipal	5	4	. 8	10	8	9	3
- First Nations		-	-	-	-	-	-
4. 2017 budget excluding municipal debt	\$ 38,955,582						
5.a) Number of board meetings per month	1		2.0		2.0	2.0	2.0
5.b) Average duration of board meetings	5-6 hrs	4-8 hrs	4-6 hrs	2-5 hrs	4 hrs	not identified	1-2 hrs
5.c) Municipal directors stay for whole meeting	no	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
					No - \$200 per		
6. Director stipend includes board meeting attendance?	no	no	no	yes	meeting	no	no
7.a) Stipend include travel time to Board Meetings?	no	no	no	yes	yes	yes	yes
			travel time included				
7.b) If no, how is travel time paid?	\$.15/km		in varied meeting fees		n/a	n/a - only mileage	n/a
8.a) Add-on for Chair?	\$ 24,102	150% of stipend	yes	\$ 22,000	\$ 12,576	\$ 15,312	\$36,383 (total)
				no - but a director			
				who chairs in the			
	\$159 to chair a		double meeting fee	absence of the Chair			
8.b) Add-on for Vice-Chair?	meeting	75% of stipend	when acting as chair	receives \$100	\$ 3,144	\$ 1,728	\$11,351 (total)
9. Directors paid to attend other meetings?	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
							\$122-\$243 depending
	\$62-\$196 based on		\$102-\$265 depending	\$65-\$130 depending	\$105-\$210 depending		if you are a director,
- If yes, amount?	type	\$75-\$185	on duration	on duration	on duration	\$ 153	chair or vice-chair
							no - conflict of
10. Directors paid to attend public hearings?	No	yes	yes	no	no	yes	interest
- If yes, amount?	n/a	\$ 75	varies	n/a	n/a	\$ 153	n/a
11. Extra paid to committee chairs?	No	yes	no	yes	yes	yes	yes
- If yes, amount?	n/a	25% of stipend	n/a	\$25 per meeting	\$ 4,188	\$13 per meeting	\$ 1,425
		UBCM/SILGA - yes;					
		FCM with board			all conferences have		UBCM - yes; FCM -
12. All directors allowed to attend conferences?	yes	approval	yes - EA only	yes - EA only	limits	yes - EA only	only Chair
					yes; meeting rate		
					depending on full		
13. Pay for travel time for attendance at above conferences?	yes - daily meeting fee	yes	sometimes	no	day/half day	no	no
							clear bylaw with no
			works well and is		clearly laid out and		potential for
14.a) What do you like about current remuneration bylaw?	not much	almost nothing	simple	pretty good	easy to apply		misinterpretation
			•				
	too much grey area;			stipend includes			
	difficulty in capturing			board meetings but if			
	meeting			a director doesn't		meeting pay is always	
	attendance/authoriza			attend, the director is		more difficult to	
	tion; inequities			not docked pay plus		manage; bylaw is a	
	between municipal	way too complex;		an alternate is paid so		little unclear about	
	and electoral area	mixes remuneration		essentially paying		meeting pay for	
14.b) What is troublesome with your current bylaw?	directors	with expenses		twice for one meeting		UBCM	
2.1.3) What is troublesome with your current bylaw:	411 201013	With expenses		the for one meeting		ODCIVI	

								Regional District					
	CSRD	Squamish Lilloet	Fraser-Fort George	Nanaimo	East Kootenay	Cowichan Valley	Alberni-Clayoquot	Powell River	Central Coast	Fraser Valley	Comox Valley	Thompson Nicola	
Summary of email answers													
		_					Rates per bylaw	-		-		-	
	\$24,102 plus	\$10,724 plus	\$14,500 plus	\$19,500 plus	\$18,000 plus	\$25,000 plus	\$6,328 plus	\$8,232 plus		\$26,940 plus	\$29,604 plus	\$18,830 plus	
Chair annual stipend	applicable stipend	applicable stipend	applicable stipend	applicable stipend	applicable stipend	applicable stipend	applicable stipend	applicable stipend	\$ 4,800	applicable stipend	applicable stipend	applicable stipend	
Municipal Director annual stipend	\$ 11,622	\$ 12,500	\$ 10,500	\$ 13,205	\$ 11,180	\$ 16,606	\$ 5,736	\$ 8,173	nil	\$ 11,557	\$ 12,072	\$12,740-\$15,600	
Electoral Area Director annual stipend	\$ 16,406	\$ 25,000	\$ 16,500	\$ 24,190	\$ 22,359	\$ 29,030	\$8,267 -\$10,351	\$11,447-\$13,339	\$1,200-\$1,800	\$ 19,177	\$ 31,128	\$20,314-\$23,954	
				•			\$65 - \$160 depending						
	\$62-\$196 based on	\$92-159 based on		\$70 - \$110 based on			on distance and	\$75-\$180 depending	\$75-\$150 based on		\$75-\$125 depending		
Committee meeting fee rates	type	duration	\$ 100	duration	\$ 185	only VITAC - \$291.07	nature	on type and duration	duration	n/a	on type	\$ 150	
								\$100 for events			\$20/hr where travel		
					\$20/hour in excess of			outside of Powell			exceeds 60km one	amount based on	
Remuneration for meeting travel	\$.15 per km	\$0-190 based on km's	n/a	n/a	30 minutes each way	n/a	n/a	River RD	n/a	n/a	way	distance	
Paid benefits included	no	yes	not identified	not identified	not identified	no	no	not identified	not identified	not identified	50% paid by RD	not identified	
							SOFI Information						
Chair	\$ 54,152	\$ 25,604	\$ 34,393	\$ 54,347	\$ 48,299	\$ 42,750	\$ 12,550	\$ 28,181	\$ 5,900	\$ 28,683	\$ 61,556		
Total EA Directors	\$ 181,478	_ :				\$ 284,637		\$ 106,676					
Average EA Director	\$ 30,246	_ '				\$ 31,626		\$ 21,335				\$ -	
Total Muni Directors	\$ 72,318		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·			\$ 108,736		\$ 21,845	n/a	\$ 159,217			
Average Muni Director	\$ 14,464		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·			\$ 18,123		\$ 10,923		\$ 10,614			
Total all directors excluding alternates	\$ 253,797												
Average per Director	\$ 23,072	\$ 18,405	\$ 16,606	\$ 24,320	\$ 24,300	\$ 26,225	\$ 6,748	\$ 18,360	\$ 4,335	\$ 13,838	\$ 30,862	\$ 19,419	
Board Remuneration from SOFI as % of Budget	0.65%	0.76%	0.51%	0.47%	0.95%	0.51%	0.53%	0.93%	0.74%	1.31%	0.28%	1.11%	

		1					
	CSRD	Caribou	Peace River	Central Okanagan	Bulkley Nechako	North Okanagan	Sunshine Coast
Summary of email answers	CSIND	Cariboa	i cace inver	central Okunagan	Bulkiey Necharo	North Okanagan	Julishine Coust
			_				
					\$12,576 plus		
					applicable stipend		
					plus \$100 per		\$36,383 plus \$243 per
	\$24,102 plus				attendance at RD	\$15,600plus	board meeting
Chair annual stipend	applicable stipend	\$ 25,245	\$ 22,200	\$ 36,000	office	applicable stipend	attended and chaired
Municipal Director annual stipend	\$ 11,622	\$ 10,098	\$ -	\$ 14,000	\$ 8,657	\$ 7,068	\$ 9,107
				\$14,000 plus			
				supplement based on	\$14,019 plus \$1 per		
Electoral Area Director annual stipend	\$ 16,406	\$ 10,098	\$ 15,600	population	resident	\$ 14,220	\$ 10,411
·		<u> </u>					
	\$62-\$196 based on	\$75-\$185 depending	\$102-\$265 depending	\$65-\$130 depending	\$100-\$200 depending		
Committee meeting fee rates	type	on type and duration	on duration	on duration	on duration	\$ 153	\$ 122
			travel time is		yes; meeting rate		
			included in meeting		depending on full		
Remuneration for meeting travel	\$.15 per km	\$20 per 100 km's	duration		day/half day	n/a	no
Paid benefits included	no	not identified	yes	not identified	not identified not identified		- yes
							,
Chair	\$ 54,152			\$ 40,661	\$ 40,490	\$ 42,369	\$ 50,046
Total EA Directors	\$ 181,478					\$ 136,897	\$ 185,052
Average EA Director	\$ 30,246	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 27,379	\$ 37,010
Total Muni Directors	\$ 72,318					\$ 113,135	\$ 56,536
Average Muni Director	\$ 14,464	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 12,571	\$ 18,845
Total all directors excluding alternates	\$ 253,797	\$ 314,583	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		\$ 313,363	\$ 253,853	\$ 241,587
Average per Director	\$ 23,072	\$ 19,661	\$ 17,336	\$ 18,962	\$ 20,891	\$ 18,132	\$ 30,198
Board Bomunovation from SOEL on 9/ of Budget	0.659/	0.469/	0.259/	0.420/	4.070/	0.220/	0.409/
Board Remuneration from SOFI as % of Budget	0.65%	0.46%	0.35%	0.42%	1.97%	0.32%	0.40%
				1			

	Alubabatical list		Total		Average		¢ρ	lar Dasidant
	Alphabetical list	Remuneration			Remuneration	Percent of Budget	\$ Per Resident	
1	Alberni-Clayoquot	\$	94,468	\$	6,748	0.5%	\$	2.99
2	Bulkley Nechako	\$	313,363	\$	20,891	2.0%	\$	7.85
3	Caribou	\$	314,583	\$	19,661	0.5%	\$	4.97
4	Central Coast	\$	21,675	\$	4,335	0.7%	\$	6.61
5	Central Okanagan	\$	227,538	\$	18,962	0.4%	\$	1.24
6	Comox Valley	\$	308,616	\$	30,862	0.3%	\$	4.79
7	Cowichan Valley	\$	393,373	\$	26,225	0.5%	\$	4.83
8	CSRD	\$	253,797	\$	23,072	0.7%	\$	4.95
9	East Kootenay	\$	364,493	\$	24,300	1.0%	\$	6.32
10	Fraser Valley	\$	318,272	\$	13,838	1.3%	\$	1.12
11	Fraser-Fort George	\$	232,483	\$	16,606	0.5%	\$	2.48
12	Nanaimo	\$	413,448	\$	24,320	0.5%	\$	2.78
13	North Okanagan	\$	253,853	\$	18,132	0.3%	\$	3.08
14	Peace River	\$	208,027	\$	17,336	0.4%	\$	3.37
15	Powell River	\$	128,521	\$	18,360	0.9%	\$	6.39
16	Squamish Lilloet	\$	165,641	\$	18,405	0.8%	\$	4.19
17	Sunshine Coast	\$	241,587	\$	30,198	0.4%	\$	8.35
18	Thompson Nicola	\$	504,885	\$	19,419	1.1%	\$	3.86

	List by Total Remuneration		Total Remuneration		Average Remuneration	Percent of Budget	\$ F	Per Resident
1	Thompson Nicola	\$	504,885	\$	19,419	1.1%	\$	3.86
2	Nanaimo	\$	413,448	\$	24,320	0.5%	\$	2.78
3	Cowichan Valley	\$	393,373	\$	26,225	0.5%	\$	4.83
4	East Kootenay	\$	364,493	\$	24,300	1.0%	\$	6.32
5	Fraser Valley	\$	318,272	\$	13,838	1.3%	\$	1.12
6	Caribou	\$	314,583	\$	19,661	0.5%	\$	4.97
7	Bulkley Nechako	\$	313,363	\$	20,891	2.0%	\$	7.85
8	Comox Valley	\$	308,616	\$	30,862	0.3%	\$	4.79
9	North Okanagan	\$	253,853	\$	18,132	0.3%	\$	3.08
10	CSRD	\$	253,797	\$	23,072	0.7%	\$	4.95
11	Sunshine Coast	\$	241,587	\$	30,198	0.4%	\$	8.35
12	Fraser-Fort George	\$	232,483	\$	16,606	0.5%	\$	2.48
13	Central Okanagan	\$	227,538	\$	18,962	0.4%	\$	1.24
14	Peace River	\$	208,027	\$	17,336	0.4%	\$	3.37
15	Squamish Lilloet	\$	165,641	\$	18,405	0.8%	\$	4.19
16	Powell River	\$	128,521	\$	18,360	0.9%	\$	6.39
17	Alberni-Clayoquot	\$	94,468	\$	6,748	0.5%	\$	2.99
18	Central Coast	\$	21,675	\$	4,335	0.7%	\$	6.61

	list by Average		Total		Average		¢ n	or Docidont
	Remuneration	Re	Remuneration		Remuneration	Percent of Budget	\$ Per Resident	
1	Comox Valley	\$	308,616	\$	30,862	0.3%	\$	4.79
2	Sunshine Coast	\$	241,587	\$	30,198	0.4%	\$	8.35
3	Cowichan Valley	\$	393,373	\$	26,225	0.5%	\$	4.83
4	Nanaimo	\$	413,448	\$	24,320	0.5%	\$	2.78
5	East Kootenay	\$	364,493	\$	24,300	1.0%	\$	6.32
6	CSRD	\$	253,797	\$	23,072	0.7%	\$	4.95
7	Bulkley Nechako	\$	313,363	\$	20,891	2.0%	\$	7.85
8	Caribou	\$	314,583	\$	19,661	0.5%	\$	4.97
9	Thompson Nicola	\$	504,885	\$	19,419	1.1%	\$	3.86
10	Central Okanagan	\$	227,538	\$	18,962	0.4%	\$	1.24
11	Squamish Lilloet	\$	165,641	\$	18,405	0.8%	\$	4.19
12	Powell River	\$	128,521	\$	18,360	0.9%	\$	6.39
13	North Okanagan	\$	253,853	\$	18,132	0.3%	\$	3.08
14	Peace River	\$	208,027	\$	17,336	0.4%	\$	3.37
15	Fraser-Fort George	\$	232,483	\$	16,606	0.5%	\$	2.48
16	Fraser Valley	\$	318,272	\$	13,838	1.3%	\$	1.12
17	Alberni-Clayoquot	\$	94,468	\$	6,748	0.5%	\$	2.99
18	Central Coast	\$	21,675	\$	4,335	0.7%	\$	6.61

	list by parcent of Budget		Total		Average		Ċ Da	r Rocidont
	list by percent of Budget	Remuneration			Remuneration	Percent of Budget	\$ Per Resident	
1	Bulkley Nechako	\$	313,363	\$	20,891	2.0%	\$	7.85
2	Fraser Valley	\$	318,272	\$	13,838	1.3%	\$	1.12
3	Thompson Nicola	\$	504,885	\$	19,419	1.1%	\$	3.86
4	East Kootenay	\$	364,493	\$	24,300	1.0%	\$	6.32
5	Powell River	\$	128,521	\$	18,360	0.9%	\$	6.39
6	Squamish Lilloet	\$	165,641	\$	18,405	0.8%	\$	4.19
7	Central Coast	\$	21,675	\$	4,335	0.7%	\$	6.61
8	CSRD	\$	253,797	\$	23,072	0.7%	\$	4.95
9	Alberni-Clayoquot	\$	94,468	\$	6,748	0.5%	\$	2.99
10	Cowichan Valley	\$	393,373	\$	26,225	0.5%	\$	4.83
11	Fraser-Fort George	\$	232,483	\$	16,606	0.5%	\$	2.48
12	Nanaimo	\$	413,448	\$	24,320	0.5%	\$	2.78
13	Caribou	\$	314,583	\$	19,661	0.5%	\$	4.97
14	Central Okanagan	\$	227,538	\$	18,962	0.4%	\$	1.24
15	Sunshine Coast	\$	241,587	\$	30,198	0.4%	\$	8.35
16	Peace River	\$	208,027	\$	17,336	0.4%	\$	3.37
17	North Okanagan	\$	253,853	\$	18,132	0.3%	\$	3.08
18	Comox Valley	\$	308,616	\$	30,862	0.3%	\$	4.79

note 1 The percent of budget uses this year's capital intensive inflated budget – typical year => 0.8%, so near top quartile (don't know if other RD budgets are in line with historical norms)

	list by \$ per Resident		Total Remuneration		Average		¢ Do	r Resident
					Remuneration	Percent of Budget	\$ PE	r kesident
1	Sunshine Coast	\$	241,587	\$	30,198	0.4%	\$	8.35
2	Bulkley Nechako	\$	313,363	\$	20,891	2.0%	\$	7.85
3	Central Coast	\$	21,675	\$	4,335	0.7%	\$	6.61
4	Powell River	\$	128,521	\$	18,360	0.9%	\$	6.39
5	East Kootenay	\$	364,493	\$	24,300	1.0%	\$	6.32
6	Caribou	\$	314,583	\$	19,661	0.5%	\$	4.97
7	CSRD	\$	253,797	\$	23,072	0.7%	\$	4.95
8	Cowichan Valley	\$	393,373	\$	26,225	0.5%	\$	4.83
9	Comox Valley	\$	308,616	\$	30,862	0.3%	\$	4.79
10	Squamish Lilloet	\$	165,641	\$	18,405	0.8%	\$	4.19
11	Thompson Nicola	\$	504,885	\$	19,419	1.1%	\$	3.86
12	Peace River	\$	208,027	\$	17,336	0.4%	\$	3.37
13	North Okanagan	\$	253,853	\$	18,132	0.3%	\$	3.08
14	Alberni-Clayoquot	\$	94,468	\$	6,748	0.5%	\$	2.99
15	Nanaimo	\$	413,448	\$	24,320	0.5%	\$	2.78
16	Fraser-Fort George	\$	232,483	\$	16,606	0.5%	\$	2.48
17	Central Okanagan	\$	227,538	\$	18,962	0.4%	\$	1.24
18	Fraser Valley	\$	318,272	\$	13,838	1.3%	\$	1.12